RECEIVED

Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

MAR 1 7 1995

Washington, D. C. 20554 FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION OFFICE OF SECRETARY

In the Matter of)
) CC Docket No. 94-102
Revision of the Commission's rules)
to ensure compatibility with) RM-8143
enhanced 911 emergency calling systems	DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL

The NYNEX Companies' Reply Comments

The NYNEX Companies hereby file their Reply to the Comments that were filed in response to the Commission's October 19, 1994 Notice of Proposed Rulemaking ("NPRM") in the above captioned proceeding.

I. INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY

In the NPRM, the Commission proposes to adopt rules to ensure compatibility between Private Branch Exchanges ("PBXs") and enhanced 911 ("E911") services and proposes to require that wireless providers that offer real time voice services include features that will make E911 services available to mobile radio callers.

NYNEX supports the rules proposed in the NPRM with minor modifications¹ and provided that those rules are implemented in the least costly manner and the cost burdens associated therewith are assigned appropriately. While the majority of commenters support the Commission's proposed PBX rules, many share NYNEX's view that the Commission must await the development of appropriate cost recovery methodologies

No. of Copies rec'd Od S List A B C D E

NYNEX comments at 4-8.

before implementing its proposals.² Accordingly, NYNEX recommends that the Commission defer its adoption of PBX rules until State and local authorities resolve E911 cost recovery issues.

The Commission's proposals for wireless services have drawn substantial criticism from a number of commenters. These commenters have raised a substantial number of issues which clearly demonstrate that the Commission's proposals for wireless emergency access are premature at this juncture.³ After our review of the positions of the parties, we are firmly convinced that the best approach to achieve wireless E911 access is one which allows marketplace forces to determine when, and how best, to implement E911 access from wireless systems.

II. THE COMMENTS SUPPORT THE COMMISSION'S PBX PROPOSALS WITH SOME MINOR MODIFICATIONS

Many of the comments describe the significant cost burdens that are incurred by telephone companies in maintaining, storing and processing updates to ALI records associated with PBX systems.⁴ Those commenters correctly urge the Commission to avoid adopting any E911 access requirements or rules that would impose any additional costs on telephone companies providing E911 or other E911 service providers.⁵ We believe, in addition, that the Commission should defer issues concerning how those cost

² See, e.g., Ameritech, Bell Atlantic NARUC, Pacific Tel., SBC, NATA and ICA.

³ See generally, comments filed by NYNEX, CTIA, GTE, BellSouth, Bell Atlantic, GTE, Springwich Cellular, Alltel, US West, Ameritech, NATA, NARUC, UTC, Pacific Tel., Illinois Telephone Assoc., PCIA, RCA, SBC and ICA.

⁴ See, e.g., comments filed by Ameritech, GTE, SBC and US West.

⁵ Id.

burdens should be recovered to states and local emergency services authorities. In the absence of appropriate cost recovery methods, it is premature to adopt any PBX E911 rules.

A number of commenters address concerns regarding the use of ISDN technology to provide connectivity directly from a PBX to a Public Safety Answering Point ("PSAP").⁶ NYNEX agrees with the commenters that complex and unresolved technical issues exist in this area.⁷ For example, a methodology must be developed to distinguish E911 ANI from call processing ANI for purposes of NPA translation. ANI transmitted from an end office to the 911 tandem is modified by the tandem prior to its retransmission to the PSAP. The first character of the ANI message is changed to a number plan digit that indicates the NPA from which the call originated. It is currently not known whether the 911 tandem will be able to provide this functionality for PBXs when ANI is transmitted from the PBX to the PSAP using ISDN technology.⁸ This technical issue and associated cost considerations must be fully resolved before ISDN E911 is implemented.⁹

⁶ See, e.g., comments filed by SBC and GTE.

⁷ NYNEX is conducting research in this area and is involved in plans to provide service to one ISDN-equipped PSAP in New York City in late 1995.

The use of ISDN technology for E911 calls from PBXs also raises technical questions regarding the capability of the 911 tandem to provide other functions for such calls. Currently the 911 tandem supports the 911 network by providing many functions required by the PSAPs, such as, selective routing, selective transfer, ring back and forced disconnect. It is not known whether the 911 tandem will be able to provide these functions for calls originating from PBXs using ISDN technology.

⁹ At the March NENA conference, the industry decided to investigate the possibility of interconnecting ISDN-equipped PBXs to the public switched telephone network in order to provide access to E911 services using network facilities. The industry also recommended that PBXs should not be directly connected to PSAPs, because such interconnections would not provide PSAPs with access to the functionality provided by the 911 tandem.

III. THE COMMENTS DEMONSTRATE THAT THE COMMISSION'S PROPOSED RULES FOR WIRELESS E911 ACCESS ARE PREMATURE

A. The Commission's Proposals Are Not Feasible Given The Current State
Of Technology

The record demonstrates that technology does not exist which will permit wireless service providers to fully comply with the Commission's proposals. ¹⁰ Indeed, the few equipment manufacturers who indicate that E911 wireless access technology may exist, describe prototype products which are based on technologies that are not fully tested and not yet available for deployment. ¹¹ As such, it would simply be impossible for wireless carriers to comply with the proposals set forth in the NPRM.

In the absence of existing technologies, NMCC has worked with local committees to provide 911 services to our customers and has maintained ongoing efforts aimed at educating and informing them about emergency services and appropriate emergency procedures within their service areas. Market pressures have been adequate to prompt firms, including NMCC, to ensure that current emergency service needs are fully satisfied. In addition, market pressures have prompted firms to engage in research and development activities in connection with technologies that could be used to support

¹⁰ US West argued, for example, that that "there is no equipment on the market, at least no equipment capable of supporting an integrated, cost effective and reliable solution". US West comments at 6. AMTA demonstrated that the Commission's "proposal raises significant technical and operational issues which may not be susceptible to reasonable resolution within the timeframe set out in the Notice". AMTA comments at 2. CTIA notes that the character of wireless technology raises unique and, to date, unresolved issues related to E911 access. CTIA comments at 3-4, 7. The technical issues described by these commenters reflect the fact that, because it is not associated with a unique address, location information is likely to be both immaterial and inaccurate for purposes of wireless emergency calls. See generally, comments filed by RCA, CTIA, US West, Bell Atlantic, Pacific Bell, Nevada Bell and Pacific Bell Mobile.

¹¹ See generally, comments filed by KLM, Smith Advanced Technology and Tendler Cellular.

wireless ALI features.¹² The Commission should continue to rely on market pressures to promote the deployment of wireless E911 and to ensure that enhanced wireless E911 capabilities are defined and developed consistent with technical and financial constraints.¹³ The industry has worked with the emerging service providers to implement emergency services in the wireless environment.¹⁴ These joint efforts will continue to enable us to provide E911 capabilities in the most efficient manner possible.

B. No Economic Justification Exists for Wireless E911 Access

PSAPs that filed comments wholeheartedly endorse the Commission's proposals, ¹⁵ but offered no evidence of their financial commitment to E911. The record does not demonstrate that PSAPs are willing to pay for the substantial instrument that would be required to implement the Commission's proposals. ¹⁶ Therefore, no economic justification supports the Commission's stringent implementation rules.

¹² See, e.g., Ameritech comments at 10.

¹³ CTIA comments at 2-3. Indeed, NYNEX and others already comply with most aspects of the NPRM's "Phase 1" proposal. See, e.g., Ameritech comments at 8-10.

¹⁴ In its comments, Springwich made the claim that wireless E911 access in Massachusetts was impeded in New England. Springwich's claim is unfounded. The New England E911 Project Management Staff has been working with the Massachusetts's Statewide Emergency Telecommunications Board (SETB) since early 1993 to define and implement an E911 wireless solution based on cell-site identification. NYNEX has actively participated in this project at the direction of the SETB. Cellular licensees including Cellular One, Bell Atlantic and SNET also joined this effort. Attached you will find a letter from the SETB's Executive Director placing the project on temporary hold pending the FCC's resolution of the instant NPRM.

¹⁵ See, e.g., comments filed by Maryland Emergency Number Systems Board, King County Police, Thurston County Department of Communications, Peninsula Communications, AACOG, Carter County, Georgia Chapter APCO, and APCO/NENA/NASNA.

¹⁶ See, e.g., CTIA comments at 19, NATA comments at 2-3. The record does not show that any PSAP has made the capital expenditures necessary to update and modernize their systems and train their personnel to handle the information transmitted to it.

6

Any requirement that carriers deploy a full set of E911 capabilities, including a wireless ALI feature, in areas where public safety organizations have chosen not to provide enhanced 911 service is unreasonable. Since local needs and funding vary, it simply does not make sense to require wireless carriers to provide enhanced 911 capabilities at all unless the public safety organization served by that wireless carrier upgrades its system and is able to use the information.¹⁷

IV. <u>CONCLUSION</u>

The Commission should adopt its PBX proposals, modified as NYNEX suggests. However, the record does not support the Commission's proposed rules for wireless E911 service. We believe that the best approach to achieve wireless E911 service in a technologically and economically sound manner is to rely on market pressures to promote the provision of those services.

Respectfully submitted,

The NYNEX Companies

1

Edward R Wholl

Jacqueline E. Holmes Nethersole

120 Bloomingdale Road White Plains, NY 10605 914-644-5525

Their Attorneys

Dated: March 17, 1995

¹⁷ CTIA comments at 19-20.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing The NYNEX Companies' Reply Comments, was served by first class United States Mail, postage prepaid, on each of the parties indicated on the attached service list, this 17th day of March, 1995.

Jamene Johnson

J. Hal Berge Peter H. Bennett Telecommunications Industry Association 2001 Pennsylvania Avenue Suite 800 Washington, D.C. 20006

Adcomm Engineering Company 14631 128th Avenue NE Kirkland, Washington 98034-4708

GTE Service Corporation Daniel L. Bart 1850 M. Street, N.W. Suite 1200 Washington, D.C. 20036 William F. Adler Steven N. Teplitz Fleischman and Walsh, L.L.P. 1400 Sixteenth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 FOR: ASSOCIATED RT, INC.

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. William B. Barfield
Thompson T. Rawls III
1155 Peachtree Street, N.E.
Suite 1800
Atlanta, Georgia 30367-6000

Charles J. Hinkle, Jr. KSI Inc. 7630 Little River Turnpike Suite 212 Annandale, Virginia 22003

The South Carolina Budget and Control Board Division of Information Resource Management Benjamin J. Griffin W. Kip Wood REED SMITH SHAW & McCLAY 1200 18th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 Robert B. Kelly KELLY & POVICH, P.C. Suite 300 1101 30th St., N.W. Washington, D.C. 20007 FOR: ADVANCED MOBILECOMM, INC.

The Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies Michael D. Lowe Lawrence W. Katz 1710 H Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006 Lewis H. Goldman Communications Unlimited, Inc. 1850 M Street, N.W. Suite 1080 Washington, D.C. 20036 S. Robert Miller
Director, OETS
Division of State Police
NJ Department of Law and Public Safety
Office of Emergency Telecommunications Svcs.
New Jersey State Police Headquarters
P.O. Box 7068
West Trenton, New Jersey 08628-0068

Laverne Hogan Executive Director 602 Sawyer Suite 710 Houston, Texas 77007

Robert L. Williams, Jr. City of Marietta Emergency Communications 112 Haynes Street, Suite 911 Marietta, GA 30060

Herman A. Bustamante Technical Director Stanford Telecommunications, Inc. 1221 Crossman Avenue Sunnyvale, CA 94089-1117

Zach D. Taylor
Executive Director
The 9-1-1 Association of Central Oklahoma
Governments
Six Broadway Executive Park
6600 North Harvey Place, Suite 200
Oklahoma City, OK 73116-7913

Scott Wollaston, Esq. Vice President & General Counsel Siemens Rolm Communications Inc. 4900 Old Ironsides Drive, M/S 103 P.O. Box 58075 Santa Clara, CA 95052-8075

Pete Luttrell, Director Greene County Emergency Communications District 111 Union Street Greeneville, TN 37743 Marlys R. Davis King County E-911 Program Manager 700 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2300 Seattle, WA 98104-5002

Elizabeth R. Sachs, Esq.
Lukas, McGowan, Nace & Gutierrez, Chartered
1111 19th Street, NW, Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20036
FOR: American Mobile Telecommunications
Association, Inc.

American Mobile Telecommunications
Association, Inc.
1150 18th Street, NW, Suite 250
Washington, DC 20036

R. Michael Senkowski
Jeffrey S. Linder
Ilene T. Weinreich
Wiley, Rein & Fielding
1776 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006
FOR: Tele-Communications Association

Lon C. Levin Vice President and Regulatory Counsel AMSC Subsidiary Corporation 10802 Park Ridge Boulevard Reston, Virginia 22091

John G. Lamb, Jr.
Northern Telecom Inc.
2100 Lakeside Boulevard
Richardson, Texas 75081-1599

Martin W. Bercovici Keller and Heckman 1001 G Street, N.W., Suite 500W Washington, D.C. 20001-4545

David C. Yandell, Section Director Technology and Operations Section Oregon State Police Emergency Management Division 595 Cottage St., NE Salem, OR 97310 Bruce D. Jacobs
Glenn S. Richards
Fisher Wayland Cooper Leader
& Zaragoza L.L.P.
2001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20006

Stephen L. Goodman
Halprin, Temple & Goodman
1100 New York Avenue, NW
Suite 650 East
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for Northern Telecom Inc.

County of Los Angeles
Thomas H. Bugbee
Bruce Malt
Regulatory Affairs
Telecommunications Branch
Information Technology Services
P.O. Box 2231
Downey, CA 90242

James Carlsen
Assistant General Counsel
Westinghouse Electric Corporation
Electronic System Group
P.O. Box 746 - MS A475
Baltimore, Md 21203

Thomas P. Perkins, Jr.
Scott A. Sawyer
Rupaco T. Gonzalez
Scott J. Smyth
Richard A. Muscat
Consumer Protection Division
Public Agency Representation Section
P.O. Box 12548, Capitol Station
Austin Texas 78711-2548

Adam A. Andersen Senior Counsel CMT Partners 651 Gateway Boulevard, 15th Floor South San Francisco, CA 94080

Peter M. Connolly
Koteen & Naftalin
1150 Connecticut Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20036
FOR: United States Cellular Corporation

Gary Jones
JEM Co-Chair
Director of Standards Policy
OMNIPOINT Corporation
1365 Garden of the Gods Road
Colorado Springs, CO 80907
FOR: PCIA

Robert A. Mazer
Rosenman & Colin
Suite 200, 1300 19th Street, N.W.
Washington, D,C, 20036
FOR: Leo One USA Corporation &
Constellation Communications, Inc.

Charles P. Featherstun
David G. Richards
1133 21st Street, N.W., Suite 900
Washington, D.C. 20036
FOR: BellSouth Corporation, BellSouth
Telecommunications, Inc., BellSouth
Enterprises, Inc., BellSouth Cellular Corp.

Thomas Gutierrez
Lukas, McGowan, Nace & Gutierrez, Chartered
Suite 1200
1111 Nineteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036
FOR: CMT Partners

Arthur A. Butler
Sara Siegler-Miller
Ater Wynne Hewitt Dodson & Skerritt
601 Union Street, Suite 5450
Seattle, Washington 98101-2327
FOR: Washington TRACER and
Oregon TRACER

Roy D. Meredith, Past President N.C. Chapter of NENA P.O. Box 429 High Point, NC 27261-0429

William B. Barfield
Jim O. Llewellyn
1155 Peachtree Street, N.E.
Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3610
FOR: BellSouth Corporation
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.
BellSouth Enterprises, Inc.
BellSouth Cellular Corp.

Dan Bart, Vice President
Eric Schimmel, Vice President
Ron Angner, Chairman
Jesse Russell, Chariman
2500 Wilson Boulevard, Suite 300
Arlington, VA 22201
FOR: Telecommunications Industry Assoc.

AMARIAN MATERIAL ...

James S. Blaszak
Ellen G. Block
Levine, Blaszak, Block & Boothby
1300 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 500
Washington, D.C. 20036
FOR: Ad Telecommunications Users
Committee, the CA. Bankers Clearing House
and the New York Clearing House Assoc.

Peter Arth, Jr.
Edward W. O'Neill
Ellen S. Levine
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
FOR: People of the State of California and the
Public Utilities Commission of the State of
California

Alfred Sonnenstrahl
Executive Director
Telecommunications for the Deaf, Inc. (TDI)
8719 Colesville Road, Suite 300
Silver Spring, MD 20910

Robert S. Koppel VP, Legal and Regulatory Affairs Richard S. Whitt Regulatory Counsel IDB Mobile Communications, Inc. 15245 Shady Grove Road, Suite 460 Rockville, MD 20850

Brian R. Moir
Moir & Hardman
2000 L Street, NW
Suite 512
Washington, DC 20036-4907
FOR: International Communications Assoc.

Danny E. Adams Ann M. Plaza Wiley, Rein & Fielding 1776 K Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006 FOR: GE Capital-ResCom

Mary A. Boyd
JEM Co-Chair
Executive Director
Texas Emergency Communications Comm.
1101 Capital of Texas Highway, South
Austin, TX 78749
FOR: PCIA

Lee M. Westfield Greg p. Proper Juliane R. Proper P. O. Box 812 Highway #371 North Walker, MN 56484

David Kelley VP Marketing Terrapin Corporation 11958 Monarch Street Garden Grove, CA 92641

Susan H. R. Jones Gardner, Carton & Douglas 1301 K Street, NW Suite 900, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 FOR: Geotek Communications Norman P. Leventhal
David S. Keir
J. Breck Blalock
Stephen D. Baruch
Leventhal, Senter & Lerman
2000 K Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20006
FOR: TRW Inc.

Glenn S. Rabin Federal Regulatory Counsel Alltel Mobile Communications, Inc. 655 15th Street, NW Suite 220 Washington, DC 20005

Jack Y. Sharp, President Kentucky Emergency Number Association 1240 Airport Road Frankfort, KY 40601

John Schroeder Florida Chapter President National Emergency Number Association Pasco County Emergency Communications 8744 Government Drive New Port Richey, FL 34654

James M. Dye Chairman PCS Committee, Georgia NENA 140 N. Marietta Parkway Marietta, GA 30060 Leonard Schuchman
President of the Systems Integration Group
Stanford Telecom
Virginia Facility
1761 Business Center Drive
Reston, VA 22090

Robert G. Oenning
Statewide E911 Program, State of Washington
Department of Community, Trade and
Economic Development
4317 6th Avenue SE
P. O. Box 48346
Olympia, WA 98504-8346

John F. Tharp
Executive Vice President
The Illinois Telephone Association
P. O. Box 730
300 East Monroe Street
Springfield, IL 62705

Patricia M. Balduf
President
Jackson County Emergency
Communications District
600 Convent Avenue
Pascagoula, MS 39567

Jeffrey L. Sheldon, General Counsel Thomas E. Goode, Staff Attorney UTC 1140 Connecticut Ave. NW Suite 1140 Washington, DC 20036 Albert Halprin Stephen L. Goodman Halprin, Temple & Goodman Suite 650 East Tower 1100 New York Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20005

R. Daniel Foley
Manager
Computer-Technology Integration
Harris Digital Telephone Systems
300 Bel Marin Keys Boulevard
P. O. Box 1188
Novato, CA 94948-1188

Michael L. King Chief of Police Anacortes Police Department 1011 - 12th Street Anacortes, WA 98221

Robert S. Koppel VP Legal and Regulator Affairs Richard S. Whitt, Regulatory Counsel IDB Mobile Communications, Inc. 15245 Shady Grove Road, Suite 460 Rockville, MD 20850

John Cusack Executive Director National Cellular SafeTalk Center 385 Airport Road, Suite A Elgin, IL 60123 David L. Zeretzke
Director
Administrative Services
San Juan County
350 Court Street #5
Friday Harbor, WA 98250

Laverne Hogan
Executive Director
Greater Harris County 911 Emergency Network
602 Sawyer, Suite 710
Houston, TX 77007

Clement J. Driscoll
C. J. Driscoll & Associates
2066 Dorado Drive
Rancho Palos Verdes, CA 90275

G. Kevin Carruth
Deputy Director
Planning and Construction Division
Department of Corrections
P. O. Box 942883
Sacramento, CA 94283-0001

Jonathan D. Blake
Kurt A. Wimmer
Covington & Burling
1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
P. O. Box 7566
Washington, DC 20044
FOR: American Personal Communications

Daniel J. Aycock, Captain Walla Walla Police Department 15 N. Third Street Walla Walla, WA 99362 Martha Carter
9-1-1 Administrator
Caddo Parish Communications District
Number One
1144 Texas Avemue
Shreveport, Louisiana 71101

Richard L. Bullock, Director Cowlitz County Technical Services Center 911 Communications Division 312 S. W. First Avenue Kelso, WA 98626-1724 Ed Hazelwood
Director of Public Safety and GIS
Elert & Associates
Telecommunications Consultants
140 Third Street South
Stillwater, MN 55082

B. J. Smith, Director 9-1-1 Emergency Telephone Operations Office of the County Administrator Hillsborough County P. O. Box 1110 Tampa, FL 33601

David L. Jones, Chairman Government and Industry Affairs Committee Rural Cellular Association 2120 L Street N.W., Suite 520 Washington, DC 20037

Jean L. Kiddoo Shelley L. Spencer Swidler & Berlin, CHTD 3000 K Street, NW Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007 FOR: Springwich Cellular Limited Partnership Andre J. Lachance
David J. Gudino
1850 M Street, N.W.
Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20036
FOR: GTE Service Corporation

Andre J. Lachance David J. Gudino 1850 M Street, NW Washington, DC 20036 Michael J. Miller President & CEO Telident, Inc. 4510 West 77th Street Suite 101 Minneapolis, MN 55435 David C. Jatlow Young & Jatlow Suite 600 2300 N Street, NW Washington, DC 20037 For: The Ericcson Corporation

Paul R. Schwedler
Carl W. Smith
Telecommunications, DoD
Defense Information Systems Agency
Code DO1
701 S. Courthouse Road
Arlington, VA 22204

Mark J. Golden Vice President of Industry Affairs The Personal Communications Industry Assoc. 1019 19th Street, NW Suite 1100 Washington, DC 20036

Philip G. Sailer PWA Rural Addressing/911 Coordinator P.O. Box 812, Highway #371N. Walker, Minnesota 56484 Robert S. Foosaner Lawrence R. Krevor Laura L. Holloway Nextel Communications, Inc. 800 Connecticut Avenue, NW Suite 1001 Washington, DC 20006

Jerome S. Caplan
Director of Compliance and
System Certification
Redcom Laboratories, Inc.
One Redcom Center
Victor, NY 14564-0995

Robert M. Gurss
Wilkes, Artis, Hedrick & Lane, Chartered
1666 K Street, NW, #1100
Washington, DC 20006
FOR: Association of Public-Safety
Communications Officials-International, Inc.

James R. Hobson
DONELAN, CLEARY, WOOD
& MASER, P.C.
1100 New York Avenue, N.W., #750
Washington, DC 20005
FOR: NENA

Raul R. Rodriguez Stephen D. Baruch Leventhal & Lerman 2000 K Street, NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20006 FOR: Starsys Global Positioning, Inc.

Peter J. Tyrrell, Esq. Springwich Cellular Limited Partnership 227 Church Street, Room 1021 New Haven, CT 06510 David L. Nace
Marci E. Greenstein
LUKAS, McGOWAN, NACE &
GUTIERREZ, Chartered
1111 19th Street, NW, 12th Floor
Washington, DC 20036
FOR: Liberty Cellular Inc.